

Minutes
Photometrics Working Group
November 19, 1999
Peabody Hotel, Orlando, FL

Chairs: Larry Lieberman; Vision Quest Lighting; Principal; Gen. Interest
Thomas Tyler; Lighting & Electronics, Inc.; Principal; Producer

Recording secretary: Karl G. Ruling

Members attending: John Luk; Altman Stage Lighting; Principal; Producer
Ed Hyatt; Boston Illumination Group, Inc.; Principal; Producer
Gregg Esakoff; ETC West (Electronic Theatre Controls, Inc.); Principal; Producer
Tom Pincu; Moodie, Pincu & Associates, Inc.; Principal; Producer
Bill Klages; New Klages Inc.; Principal; User
Ken Vannice; NSI Corporation (Leviton Manufacturing Co., Inc.); Principal;
Producer
Tim Hansen; Oasis Stage Werks; Principal; User
Tim Cox; PLASA; Principal; Gen. Interest
Daniel K. Haydt; Remote Source Lighting International; Principal; Producer
Joseph M. Good, III; Spectrum Professional Services; Principal; Gen. Interest
Milton Davis; Strand Lighting (Strand Lighting Ltd.); Alternate; Producer
David Steven; Strand Lighting Ltd.; Principal; Producer (joined at this meeting)
Jerry Gorrell; Theatre Safety Programs; Principal; User

Visitors: Richard G. Collins, Osram/Sylvania

1 Opening Remarks

The meeting was called to order by Tom Tyler at 9:08 a.m.

1.1 Robert's Rules (Review for those that missed last meeting)

Tyler reminded people that we would be operating under Robert's Rules of Order, and that perhaps the most important of those rules is the requirement that speakers be recognized by the chair before addressing the body. He asked that anyone wishing to speak raise his hand to be recognized.

1.2 Attendance requirement

Tyler reminded the group that at the last working group meeting an attendance requirement was established. If a voting member misses three meetings in a row, they are moved to observer status. This will be done at the end of the third meeting missed.

2 Attendance and membership

2.1 Introductions of those present

Those present introduced themselves, proceeding around the table in a counter-clockwise direction.

2.2 Determination of quorum (7 needed)

Tyler announced that we have a quorum.

2.3 Recognition of alternate voting members

The group was reminded that each organization has only one vote. Principals and alternates may not all vote if all are present. Only one may vote.

2.4 Requirements for membership

The attendance requirement was briefly reviewed again. The working group is open to all who are materially affected by the work of the group.

2.5 Processing of new membership requests

Applications had been received from:

Bill Ellis, Candela Controls; Observer; User
David Steven; Strand Lighting, Ltd.; Principal; Producer
Hiroshi Kita; Marumo Electric Co., Ltd.; Observer; Producer
Eckart Steffens; Soundlight (VPLT); Observer; General Interest
Tom Tyler; Lighting & Electronics; Principal; Producer (change of employer)

Jody Good moved that all the applications be accepted. Jerry Gorrell seconded the motion. Accepted unanimously by a show of hands.

3 Approval of the minutes from the previous meeting

Jerry Gorrell moved that the minutes be accepted as written. Tim Cox second. Unanimous.

4 Call for patents

Tom Tyler read the following:

"ESTA intends to publish no standard that contains protected intellectual property, unless that property can be licensed by anyone for a reasonable fee. ESTA uses a process of open patent disclosure to implement this intent. ESTA does not conduct patent searches and does not warrant that its standards contain no protected intellectual property. "

"In keeping with the open disclosure policy, I ask if anyone present wishes to notify the working group of the existence of a patent or copyright that might protect material in a standard being developed by the working group. You need not be the holder of the patent or copyright in order to notify the working group of its existence."

No patent or intellectual property issues were identified by any group members.

Tom Tyler also read the following Anti-Trust Statement:

"The ESTA Board of Directors, the Technical Standards Committee, and the leadership of this Working Group will reject or nullify any actions that restrain trade. Anyone who feels that an action restraining trade is being or has been taken is requested to bring the matter to the attention of the chair immediately. Anyone who feels that actions in restraint of trade have been taken and not properly annulled is requested to notify the TSC chair or ESTA president immediately."

"ESTA legal counsel has informed us that any member of this working group may be found individually liable for any action that restrains trade taken by this working group. An individual convicted of a violation of the Sherman Act may be fined as much as \$100,000 and be imprisoned for up to three years. An easy to read pamphlet describing restraint of trade is available from the Technical Standards Committee."

No anti-trust issues were raised by any of the group members.

5 Approval of agenda

Tim Hansen moved that the agenda be accepted. Bill Klages seconded the motion. Unanimous.

6 Task group reports

6.1 Report on how photometrics are currently done

Tom Pincu and Dan Haydt gave an explanation of a way of measuring the lumen output from a luminaire.

The majority opinion was that it was a good explanation of one way to do measure lumen output. The task group was encouraged to further the presentation into some sort of document.

6.2 Explanation of photometric procedures: Bill Klages, Anne Valentino

No report. Klages says they are waiting for approval of the method they will be the subject of their explanation.

6.3 IES testing RP update: Lee Bloch, Jody Good, Jim Grosh, Gregg Esakoff, Ron Rykowski

The visiting Vice President of the IES, Richard Collins of Osram/Sylvania, offered a plea for input from us, particularly for a timeline and sense of urgency.

Jerry Gorrell said that technical issues that were decided at the IES meeting at Light Fair are not in the current draft, so progress that was made has been lost.

Jody Good volunteered to be appointed the head of the IES/ESTA liaison group. Larry Lieberman and Tom Tyler have taken this under advisement.

Jody Good asked for this group to comment on the draft IES document. This document to be sent to the working group by December 1, with responses to be returned back to Jody by December 10, 1999.

6.4 Nutrition Label task group: Larry Lieberman, Gregg Esakoff, Tom Tyler, Danny Haydt, Rick Loudenburg

6.4.1 Discussion of 2nd round of resolutions (Photo/99-5008)

Tom Tyler and Larry Lieberman turned over chairing the discussion to Ruling so they could vote and discuss more freely.

Comment 5: Jerry Gorrell moved that we accept the amended resolution to comment #5. Motion was seconded by Gregg Esakoff. 12 in favor, none opposed. Motion carries with a supermajority.

Comment 23: Tim Hansen moved we accept the response. Tom Tyler seconded. 12 in favor; 2 abstentions; none opposed. Motion carried with supermajority.

Comment 25: Tim Hansen moved that the new response be accepted. Jerry Gorrell seconded the motion. Unanimous. Motion carried with supermajority.

Comment 27: Tim Hansen moved that the response be accepted. Tom Tyler seconded. Unanimous.

Comment 29: Tom Tyler moved to accept the response. Ken Vannice second. Unanimous.

Comment 35: Tom Pincu moved to accept the response. Jody Good second. Unanimous.

Comment 47: The suggested response was amended to read:

beam lumens: The lumens falling within the half-peak illuminance angle.
field lumens: The lumens falling within the tenth-peak illuminance angle.

The rest of the suggested response was not changed. Gregg Esakoff moved to accept the response so amended. Tom Tyler seconded the motion. Fourteen in favor with none opposed. Motion passed.

New change: Jody Good moved that the definition for light beam in the draft standard be tied back to the notion of 3% illumination and that the word "useful" be deleted. Thus, the definition would read:

2.9 light beam: The light emitted from the exit aperture of a luminaire and providing illumination equal to or greater than 3% of the maximum level of illumination.

Jerry Gorrell seconded the motion. Unanimous. Motion passed.

New change: Tom Tyler moved that the task group be directed to clean up all the definitions in an attempt to use as much common language as possible. Ed Hyatt seconded the motion. Unanimous. Motion passed.

Comment 62: Tom Tyler moved that the newly proposed response be accepted. Lieberman seconded the motion. Unanimous, which is the required supermajority. Motion passed.

Comment 77: Tim Hansen moved that the proposed response be accepted. Tom Pincu seconded the motion. Unanimous. Motion passed.

Comment 88: Tom Pincu moved that the resolution be accepted. Jerry Gorrell seconded the motion. A unanimous 14 were in favor, so the motion passed.

Comment 90: After some discussion, Tom Tyler moved that the response should be accepted as written, but with the following changes:

3.2.2.8 luminaires designed to light a flat surface at an oblique angle

In the case of a luminaire designed to light a flat surface at an oblique angle, such as a cyclorama light and wall washers, shall have the angle of the luminaire in relation to the surface that was used for generating the presented data shall be reported in an unambiguous manner.

Tim Hansen seconded the motion. Unanimous.

Comment 100: Jody Good moved that the response be accepted with the following amended wording:

3.2.2.4 Multiple-lamp luminaires

Units with multiple lamps that are intended to be used together on a circuit shall include ~~iso-lux~~ iso-illuminance diagrams showing the luminaire's performance with these lamps used in concert. It shall not be permissible to show the performance of a single lamp, unless the unit is designed to be used in that fashion. If a luminaire is available in different configurations, for example, with different numbers of lamps or different types of lamps, and these different configurations have different lumen outputs or illumination distributions, then the exact testing configuration shall be reported ~~then each configuration shall have its photometric performance represented by its own set of data.~~ Luminaires with multiple tilting, swiveling, or otherwise adjustable lamps also shall comply with the provisions in section 3.2.2.7.

Tim Hansen seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Comment 101: Tim Hansen moved that the resolution be accepted. Gregg Esakoff seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

Ruling returned the chair back to Tom Tyler and Larry Lieberman.

6.4.2 Vote to accept resolutions

Tim Hansen moved that the resolutions to the comments in Photo/99-5008, with the above amendments, be accepted, and that the task group be directed to incorporate the resolutions into the draft E1.9 document and present a revised document in time for the January meeting. Jerry Gorrell seconded the motion. Motion carried unanimously.

6.4.3 Status of additional photometric examples from Ron Rykowski

No report.

7 Other business

Ruling repeated the invitation to group and any observers present to write articles for Protocol.

8 Schedule for future meetings

Tom Tyler announced that the next meeting will be at the Dallas/Ft. Worth Airport Marriott in Irving, Texas, at 1:00 p.m. on January 22, 2000.

9 Adjournment

Tom Pincu moved that the meeting adjourn. John Luk seconded the motion. Motion was accepted unanimously. Tom Tyler declared the meeting adjourned at 12:27.

Working Group Membership at End of Meeting

Name	Company	Parent Co./Org Represented	Voting Status	Interest Category
Andre Broucke	ADB - TTV Technologies	Siemens	O	P
John Luk	Altman Stage Lighting	Altman Stage Lighting	P	P
Rick Loudenburg	Barbizon Rockies	Barbizon Companies	P	G
Lee J. Bloch	Bloch Design Group Inc.	Bloch Design Group Inc.	P	U
Ed Hyatt	Boston Illumination Group, Inc.	Boston Illumination Group	P	P
Bill Ellis	Candela Controls, Inc.	Candela Controls, Inc.	O	U
Francesco Romagnoli	Clay Paky S.P.A.	Clay Paky S.P.A.	A	P
Angelo Cavenati	Clay Paky S.P.A.	Clay Paky S.P.A.	P	P
David Bertenshaw	David Bertenshaw	David Bertenshaw	O	P
Ronald G. Mink	Electronic Theatre Controls	Electronic Theatre Controls, Inc.	A	P
Gregg Esakoff	ETC West	Electronic Theatre Controls, Inc.	P	P
Mike Wood	High End Systems	High End Systems	O	P
Jim McHugh	Humboldt State University/IES	Humboldt State University	P	U
Edwin S. Kramer	IATSE, Local 1	I.A.T.S.E. Local 1	P	U
Jim Grosh	Jim Grosh Associates	Jim Grosh Associates	P	G
Thomas Tyler	Lighting & Electronics, Inc.	Lighting & Electronics, Inc.	P	P
Hiroshi Kita	Marumo Electric Co., Ltd.	Marumo Electric Co., Ltd.	O	P
Tom Pincu	Moodie, Pincu & Associates, Inc.	Moodie, Pincu & Associates, Inc.	P	P
Bill Klages	New Klages Inc.	New Klages Inc.	P	U
Ken Vannice	NSI Corporation	Leviton Manufacturing Co., Inc.	P	P
Tim Hansen	Oasis Stage Werks	Oasis Stage Werks	P	U
Tim Cox	PLASA	PLASA	P	G
Tony Douglas-Beveridge	PLASA Standards Office	PLASA	A	
Ron Rykowski	Radiant Imaging, Inc.	Radiant Imaging, Inc.	P	P
Daniel K. Haydt	Remote Source Lighting International	Remote Source Lighting International	P	P
Robert Mumm	Robert Mumm	Robert Mumm	O	G
Mitch Hefter	Rosco/Entertainment Technology	Rosco Laboratories	O	U
Eckart Steffens	Soundlight	VPLT	O	G
Joseph M. Good, III	Spectrum Professional Services	Spectrum Professional Services	P	G
Milton Davis	Strand Lighting	Strand Lighting	A	P
David Steven	Strand Lighting Ltd.	Strand Lighting	P	P
Jerry Gorrell	Theatre Safety Programs	Theatre Safety Programs	P	U
Thomas A. Hough	Vari-Lite, Inc.	Vari-Lite, Inc.	O	G
Larry Lieberman	Vision Quest Lighting	Vision Quest Lighting	P	G

Voting Status

- P Principal voting representative for a company or organization
- A Alternate voting representative for a company or organization
- I Individual representing no organization other than himself or herself
- O Observer; non-voting

Interest Categories

- P Producer (manufacturer) of luminaires
- U User of luminaires
- G General interest in luminaires