

Minutes
Photometrics Working Group
Saturday, 26 July 2003
Dallas/Ft. Worth Airport Marriott South
Ft. Worth, TX

Chairman: Jerry Gorrell; Theatre Safety Programs; P; U

Recording secretary: Karl G. Ruling; ESTA

Members attending: Larry Lieberman; Vision Quest Lighting; P; CP (present by telephone for part of the meeting)
Ken Vannice; Colortran; Leviton Manufacturing Co., Inc.; P; MP
Michael Lay; Strand Lighting; Strand Lighting Ltd.; P; MP
Thomas Tyler; Altman Stage Lighting; A; MP (rejoined with new company representation at this meeting)
Dawn K. Crosby; Vari-Lite (Genlyte Thomas Group LLC); O; MP (joined at this meeting)

Visitors: None

1 Opening Remarks

The meeting was called to order at 13:10 by Jerry Gorrell.

2 Attendance and membership

Larry Lieberman participated via telephone for the beginning of the meeting.
A blue attendance sheet was circulated and those present were instructed by Karl Ruling to sign in.

2.1 Introductions of those present

Jerry Gorrell asked those present to introduce themselves, which they did.

2.2 Determination of quorum

Jerry Gorrell announced that we have a quorum of four with Larry Lieberman on the phone.

2.3 Recognition of alternate voting members

Gorrell noted that we have no cases of a principal and an alternate being present, so there could be no confusion in voting.

2.4 Requirements for membership

The following statement of the requirements for membership was read by Jerry Gorrell:

"Membership is open to all who are affected by the work of the group, but voting members are required to vote on letter ballots and to attend meetings. If a voting member and his alternate both miss three meetings in a row, they are moved to observer status. This will be done at the end of the third meeting missed."

2.5 Processing of new membership requests

The following applications had been received and were read aloud by Karl Ruling:

Woody Smith; Coemar; principal; mass-market producer
Robert Mokry; I C Lighting; principal; general interest
Andrew Nichols; Selecon NZ Ltd.; principal; mass-market producer
Thomas P. Tyler; Altman Stage Lighting (new employer); alternate; mass-market producer
Afsan Quazi; Lighting & Electronics; observer; general interest
Ashley Rice; Lighting & Electronics; observer; general interest
Dawn K. Crosby; Vari-Lite (Genlyte Thomas Group); observer; mass-market producer

Ruling suggested that those applying as voting members but who were not present be accepted as observers. If they were accepted as voting members, the voting body would increase, thus increasing the quorum requirement, and the assembly would no longer have a quorum present to conduct business. Furthermore, one of the basic requirements for voting membership is that voting members attend, and their absence now did not augur well for attendance in the future.

Ken Vannice moved that the applications be accepted, but with those not present applying for voting status be accepted as observers. The motion was seconded. The motion was accepted with a unanimous voice vote. The new members were voted in with the following voting statuses and interest categories:

Woody Smith; Coemar; observer; mass-market producer
 Robert Mokry; I C Lighting; observer; general interest
 Andrew Nichols; Selecon NZ Ltd.; observer; mass-market producer
 Thomas P. Tyler; Altman Stage Lighting; alternate; mass-market producer
 Afsan Quazi; Lighting & Electronics; observer; general interest
 Ashley Rice; Lighting & Electronics; observer; general interest
 Dawn K. Crosby; Vari-Lite (Genlyte Thomas Group); observer; mass-market producer

Larry Lieberman left the meeting at this point, leaving a four voting members present.

The complete voting body during the meeting, including those not present, was:

Name	Company	Representing (sort field.)	Voting status	Interest categories					
				G	U	MP	CP	DR	
John T. Ryan	Altman Stage Lighting	Altman Stage Lighting	P			1			
Tom Tyler	Altman Stage Lighting	Altman Stage Lighting	A						
Rick Loudenburg	Barbizon Rockies	Barbizon Companies	P					1	
Ed Hyatt	Boston Illumination Group, Inc.	Boston Illumination Group	P				1		
Gregg Esakoff	ETC West	Electronic Theatre Controls, Inc.	P			1			
Jim McHugh	Humboldt State University/IES	Humboldt State University	P		1				
Ken Vannice	Colortran	Leviton Manufacturing Co., Inc.	P			1			
Bill Klages	New Klages Inc.	New Klages Inc.	P		1				
James Eade	PLASA	PLASA	P	1					
Tony Douglas-Beveridge	PLASA	PLASA	A						
Michael Lay	Strand Lighting	Strand Lighting Ltd.	P			1			
Jerry Gorrell	Theatre Safety Programs	Theatre Safety Programs	P		1				
Larry Lieberman	Vision Quest Lighting	Vision Quest Lighting	P				1		
				11	1	3	4	2	1

3 Approval of the minutes from the previous meeting

Tom Tyler moved that the draft minutes be accepted as written. The motion was seconded. The motion was accepted with a show of hands, with three voting in favor, and one abstention. A simple majority is required for accepting minutes.

4 Call for patents

Jerry Gorrell read the following aloud:

"ESTA intends to publish no standard that contains protected intellectual property, unless that property can be licensed by anyone for a reasonable fee. ESTA uses a process of open patent disclosure to implement this intent. ESTA does not conduct patent searches and does not warrant that its standards contain no protected intellectual property.

"In keeping with the open disclosure policy, I ask if anyone present wishes to notify the working group of the existence of a patent or copyright that might protect material in a standard being developed by the working group. You need not be the holder of the patent or copyright in order to notify the working group of its existence."

No intellectual property issues were brought to the attention of the assembly.

Anti-Trust Statement

Gorrell read the following aloud:

"The ESTA Board of Directors, the Technical Standards Committee, and the leadership of this Working Group will reject or nullify any actions that restrain trade. Anyone who feels that an action restraining trade is being or has been taken is requested to bring the matter to the attention of the chair immediately. Anyone who feels that actions in restraint of trade have been taken and not properly annulled is requested to notify the TSC chair or ESTA president immediately.

"ESTA legal counsel has informed us that any member of this working group may be found individually liable for any action that restrains trade taken by this working group. An individual convicted of a violation of the Sherman Act may be fined as much as \$100,000 and be imprisoned for up to three years. An easy to read pamphlet describing restraint of trade is available from the Technical Standards Committee."

No anti-trust or restraint of trade issues were brought to the attention of the assembly.

5 Approval of agenda

Ken Vannice moved that the draft agenda be accepted. The motion was seconded. The motion was accepted with a unanimous show of hands.

6 Old Business

6.1 Data sheet examples

Ruling reported on problems he has had with the files sent by Jim McHugh. All the alphabetical characters show up as Greek characters. "Cyc" for example reads as "Χψχ." It was decided that Ruling will send the files to Jerry Gorrell who will try to open and resave the files.

6.2 Review of IESNA LM-73

There was a discussion of the latest version of the draft LM-73.

Ken Vannice moved that we respond to the IESNA's latest version of LM-73 by stating that the testing committee has adequately responded to our comments. We have no objection to the document being published as it stands at this time.

The motion was seconded. The motion was approved by a unanimous show of hands.

6.3 Review BSR E1.25

Andrew Nichols's comments on BSR E1.25 version r2 was discussed and the document revised to make a version r3. The responses to Nichol's comments were as follows:

1.0. Fine as read.

Thank you.

2.0. Fine as read.

Thank you.

3.0. This would mean that test equipment used would need to have the same margin of error in each test otherwise the published results from testing on equipment with differing margins of error may result in differing lighoutputs up and down due to the varying permissible margin of error in the test equipment. The alternative is use what ever testing equipment you like but publish the manufacturers margin of error.

We disagree. We don't want to specify a margin of error for all test equipment, as that seems intrusive and unnecessary. We note that it is in the manufacturer's interest to use equipment with the least error. There is no market advantage to using equipment with a wider margin of error, since error is as likely to be unfavorable as favorable. In any case, the margin of error for almost all testing equipment is far less than the variations caused by variations in luminaire manufacturing or luminaire maintenance by the end-user.

4.0 I take it this means a random from 10 calibrated lamps. The outputs of the calibrated lamp used should be published so can be compared with the standard catalogue lamps of the same manufacturer. A need for a stable and calibrated power supply is paramount to meaningful results in any of the tests. In point 4.0 and point 5.0 there is a difference of the time before testing. One stating 10 minutes and the other 15 minutes. Experience would lead me to suggest 15 minutes minimum to allow for heat soaking to occur.

We did not intend to require selection from an assortment of calibrated lamps. That does not seem to be useful; knowing the output of whatever lamp is used is enough. We have resolved the difference in time by using the 15 minutes you have suggested. The stable supply is covered in section 6.

5.0 Fine as read.

Thank you.

6.0 The +1/-3 volts AC tolerance during testing seems too much particularly for low voltage and extra low voltage fittings where the impact will be greatest.

You are right. A 4-volt range is probably too much in any case, but it is definitely too much with low-voltage equipment. We have changed this to a plus or minus 0.5 percent range.

7.0 Fine as read but the margin of error permissible must be the same on all test equipment.

Reject. See our response to your comment on section 3.0.

8.00 Does this standard imply that all existing equipment will need to be retested to this standard?

Not necessarily. First, this is a voluntary standard, so no one will be required to test to it. Secondly, it is quite possible that whatever testing has been done has been done with conditions within the range specified by this draft standard. We have attempted to state reasonable requirements that are not wildly at odds with current practice.

Ken Vannice moved that Karl Ruling send these responses to Nichols's comments to Andrew Nichols. The motion was seconded. The motion was approved by a unanimous voice vote.

Tom Tyler moved that version of the draft document devised at this meeting (Photo/2003-5001r3) go to public review. The motion was seconded. Per our P&P, the motion will be decided by letter ballot.

7 New business

Five ESTA bucks were given to each attendee by Jerry Gorrell in thanks for their dedication and hard work.

No voting members needed to be changed to observer status for lack of attendance.

8 Other business

The new archived email reflectors were discussed. Ruling encouraged all to register.

9 Schedule for future meetings

Ruling announced that the next meeting would be Friday, 21 November 2003, from 09:00 to noon at the Sheraton World Resort in Orlando. The following meeting is scheduled for Saturday, 17 January 2004, from 13:00 to 17:00 at the Dallas/Ft. Worth Marriott South in Ft. Worth, TX.

10 Adjournment

Ken Vannice moved that the meeting adjourn. The motion was seconded. The motion was accepted with a unanimous voice vote. Jerry Gorrell declared the meeting adjourned at 15:33.

Photometrics Working Group Membership and Contact Information as of 26 August 2003

Name	Company	Representing (sort field)	Voting status	Int. cat.
Andre Broucke	ADB - TTV Technologies	ADB-TTV Group	O	MP
John T. Ryan	Altman Stage Lighting	Altman Stage Lighting	P	MP
John Luk	Altman Stage Lighting	Altman Stage Lighting	O	MP
Thomas Tyler	Altman Stage Lighting	Altman Stage Lighting	A	MP
Rick Loudenburg	Barbizon Light (Denver)	Barbizon Companies	P	DR
Lee J. Bloch	Blue Sky Design, Ltd.	Blue Sky Design, Ltd.	O	U
Ed Hyatt	Boston Illumination Group, Inc.	Boston Illumination Group	P	CP
Bill Ellis	Candela Controls, Inc.	Candela Controls, Inc.	O	U
Francesco Romagnoli	Clay Paky S.P.A.	Clay Paky S.P.A.	O	MP
Woody Smith	Coemar USA Inc.	Coemar USA Inc.	O	MP
David Bertenshaw	David Bertenshaw	David Bertenshaw	O	G
A C Hickox	Domingo Gonzalez Associates	Domingo Gonzalez Associates	O	U
Gregg Esakoff	ETC West	Electronic Theatre Controls, Inc.	P	MP
Mitch Hefter	Entertainment Technology	Genlyte Thomas Group LLC	O	G
Dawn K. Crosby	Vari-Lite	Genlyte Thomas Group LLC	O	MP
Mike Wood	High End Systems Inc.	High End Systems Inc.	O	MP
Jim McHugh	Humboldt State University/IES	Humboldt State University	P	U
Robert Mokry	I C Lighting	I C Lighting	O	G
Jim Grosh	Jim Grosh Associates	Jim Grosh Associates	O	G
Ken Vannice	Colortran	Leviton Manufacturing Co., Inc.	P	MP
Afsan Quazi	Lighting & Electronics, Inc.	Lighting & Electronics, Inc.	O	G
Ashley Rice	Lighting & Electronics, Inc.	Lighting & Electronics, Inc.	O	G
Hiroshi Kita	Marumo Electric Co., Ltd.	Marumo Electric Co., Ltd.	O	MP
Tom Pincu	Moodie, Pincu & Associates, Inc.	Moodie, Pincu & Associates, Inc.	O	MP
Bill Klages	New Klages Inc.	New Klages Inc.	P	U
Tim Hansen	Oasis Stage Werks	Oasis Stage Werks	O	U
James Eade	PLASA	PLASA	P	G
Tony Douglas-Beveridge	PLASA Standards Office	PLASA	A	G
Ron Rykowski	Radiant Imaging, Inc.	Radiant Imaging, Inc.	O	G
David Jenkins	Radiant Imaging, Inc.	Radiant Imaging, Inc.	O	G
Robert Mumm	Robert Mumm	Robert Mumm	O	G
Andrew Nichols	Selecon	Selecon NZ Ltd.	O	MP
Robert Barbagallo	Solotech Inc.	Solotech Inc.	O	DR
Joseph M. Good, III	Spectrum Professional Services	Spectrum Professional Services	O	G
Michael Lay	Strand Lighting	Strand Lighting Ltd.	P	MP
Jerry Gorrell	Theatre Safety Programs	Theatre Safety Programs	P	U
Larry Lieberman	Vision Quest Lighting	Vision Quest Lighting	P	CP
Eckart Steffens	SOUNDLIGHT	VPLT	O	G

Key to codes:

- P principal voting member
- A alternate voting member
- I individual voting member
- O observer, non-voting
- MP mass-market producer interest category
- CP custom-market producer interest category
- DR dealer or rental company interest category
- U user interest category
- G general-interest interest category